

CONCLUSIONS

Housing Laboratory (LAV) on Integration of Housing in National Policy on Comprehensive Development of Cities BOLIVIA

UHPH's Thematic: Regulatory frameworks, public policy and governance

UHPH's Sub-thematic: Integration of urban public policy and housing

February 2019

Joint LAV | Residents of La Paz – Bolivia, participate from
OIM¹ headquarters

ORGANIZED BY:



WITH THE SUPPORT FROM:



1 Content

1. CONTEXT	3
1.1 Urban National Policy for the Comprehensive Development of Cities	3
1.2 Integration of housing in urban policy and global agendas	3
2. HOUSING LABORATORY (LAV) ON INTEGRATION OF HOUSING IN NATIONAL POLICY ON COMPREHENSIVE DEVELOPMENT OF CITIES OF BOLIVIA.....	5
2.1 Objectives	5
2.2 Methodology	5
2.3 Participants	6
2.4 Inputs from previous LAVs.....	7
3. CONCLUSIONS FROM THE LAV	9
3.1 Approach through planning instruments	9
3.2 Approach through the application of housing policy.....	11
3.3 Approach through alliances with participating actors	13
3.4 Approach through the strengthening of capabilities	14
3.5 Good practices identified	15

1. CONTEXT

1.1 National Urban Policy for the Comprehensive Development of Cities

The LAV "Integration of Housing in the National Policy for the Comprehensive Development of Cities" was carried out as part of the work framed in the international cooperation agreement signed by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA) and the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat) whose objective is to support the Government of the Plurinational State of Bolivia in the formulation and implementation of a National Policy for the Comprehensive Development of Cities (PNDIC for its acronym in Spanish), within the framework of a urban agenda that contributes to human settlements sustainable development in Bolivia, applying the methodologies and experience developed by UN-Habitat and the United Nations system, with the objective of contributing to the achievement of the great purposes of Living Well of the Patriotic Agenda of the Government of Bolivia, which includes the fight against poverty.

This agreement will be implemented through three work packages: 1. Formulation of the National Policy for the Comprehensive Development of Cities; 2. Development of the operational capability for the implementation of the PNDIC and the means for its monitoring and evaluation; 3. Integration of the support of the United Nations System in Bolivia for the formulation of the PNDIC and to accompany the processes of early implementation.

1.2 Integration of housing in urban policy and global agendas

The 2030 Agenda considers that housing and human settlements have a fundamental role to fulfill its objectives and goals, as well as to guarantee the achievement of the human right to housing and other human rights. Thus, a new paradigm emerges in which housing is the central element of sustainable development in order to leave no one behind. This is the focus of *Housing-to-Center (Vivienda al Centro)*, which places people and human rights at the forefront of sustainable urban development (UN-Habitat, 2015).

Housing-to-Center seeks to recognize the important role of housing in development, stimulation of the economy, reduction of poverty, and inclusion in the urbanization process. This global approach, developed by UN-Habitat in 2015, includes goals at the national and local levels; at a national scale it promotes the integration of housing in urban policies and its insertion in strategic actions of international collaboration on planned urbanization; locally, it seeks to reinforce the linkage between housing, planning and urban management to improve people's living conditions and the development of cities. *Housing-to-Center* strategically establishes the opportunities offered by housing on the international agenda regarding the future of urbanization (UN-Habitat, 2015).

In addition, the New Urban Agenda places housing at the center of sustainable development as one of the transformative forces that can lead the world to overcome the challenges related to climate change, poverty, exclusion and inequality and positively influence the cities to embark on a path to inclusive, planned and sustainable urbanization.

2. HOUSING LABORATORY (LAV) ON INTEGRATION OF HOUSING ON NATIONAL POLICY OF COMPREHENSIVE DEVELOPMENT OF CITIES OF BOLIVIA

2.1 Objectives

- 2.1.1 Raise awareness of the relevance of integrating housing and urban development policies in Bolivia.
- 2.1.2 Identify and define alternative solutions and specific programs to favor an adequate regulatory and institutional coordination.
- 2.1.3 Know and exchange inspiring national and international practices related to the integration of housing in urban policies.

2.2 Methodology

The LAV took place in two sessions, the first one on February 1 and the second on February 28. Prior to the first session, a concept note and a technical annex with basic data on the housing problem in Bolivia were circulated among all the participants.

The guiding questions for the first session were the following:

1. *What elements should the urban and territorial planning instruments consider or include favoring the integration of housing in the planned cities of Bolivia?*
2. *How should housing public policy be implemented so that it has an impact on the comprehensive development of cities? In this sense, what financial tools or mechanisms do you suggest can be implemented to favor this implementation?*
3. *What alliances should be established or facilitated to contribute to the integration of housing in the PNDIC?*
4. *How should the development or strengthening of capabilities be proposed to obtain a maximum impact on the integration between housing policies and sustainable development in cities?*

After the first session, the systematization of the results was shared with all the participants to carry out, once their comments were received, a second concept note for the final session of the LAV, which included the following guiding questions to continue deepening the debate that was developed during the first session:

1. *What elements should the urban and territorial planning instruments consider or include favoring the integration of housing in the planned cities of Bolivia?*

2. *How should housing public policy be implemented so that it has an impact on the comprehensive development of cities? In this sense, what financial tools or mechanisms do you suggest can be implemented to favor this implementation?*
3. *What alliances should be established or facilitated to contribute to the integration of housing in the PNDIC?*
4. *How should the development or strengthening of capabilities be proposed to obtain a maximum impact on the integration between housing policies and sustainable development in cities?*

After the second session, the systematization of the results of that final session was shared with the participants so that, once comments were received, this document of conclusions could be prepared. All the information that has resulted from the process will be part of the formulation of the housing component in the PNDIC. Likewise, the publication in the Urban Housing Practitioners Hub (UHPH) platform is expected. www.uhph.org

2.3 Participants

The LAV had the participation of national and international experts on the subject, as well as representatives of reference institutions in the Bolivian housing sector:

Zaida Albino, Martha Arévalo Gabriel Blanco, Sergio Blanco, Héctor Becerril, Claudia Bustos, Sandra Bustamante, Bernardo Castillo, Sirly Castro, Jashilma Chacón Peredo, Orlando Darita, Sophie Devine, Mercedes Di Virgilio, Jeremías Diez-Canedo, Fernando Duarte Callizo, José Fernandez, José Freitas, Diego Goyazos, Patricia Gryciuk, Ricardo Jordan, Graciela Landaeta, Esteban León, Fiona Littlejohn-Carrillo, Inés Magalhaes, Anelisse Meléndez, Katrin Quillaguamán, Mónica Ramírez, Carlos Revilla, Escarlem Rodríguez, Anaclaudia Rossbach, Ana Ruiz Nieves, Paulina Saball, Martha Sánchez, Patricia Urquieta, Magalí Valdez, Raúl Valles, Moira Vargas, Tulio Vázquez, Helmut Vega, Pablo Vitale, Yamil Vizcarra, Maria Luisa Zanelli.

2.4 Inputs from previous LAVs

In the framework of the LAVs of Public policies and integrated national frameworks, Land-based financing and Comprehensive improvement of housing and slums, carried out in Santo Domingo from June 12 to 14, 2018, the following key elements related to the LAV Integration of housing in the national policy of comprehensive development of the cities of Bolivia were identified.

Main challenges

- Harmonization of constitutional frameworks, national frameworks and sectorial regulations; housing, land and urban development policies, and the actions of the different levels of government, private sector, the third sector and civil society.
- Reduction or resolution of conflicts between the different levels of government and other actors such as the private sector, in relation to the distribution of resources, functions and powers.
- Strengthening an institutional framework that conducts with technical and political capabilities the challenges of the New Urban Agenda - NUA and the Sustainable Development Goals – SDG.
- Promotion of integrated models of housing financing and urban planning for access to land and housing aligned with the NUA, creating inclusive and equitable cities.
- Development of comprehensive improvement programs in formal and informal slums.
- Incorporation of the dimension of resilience and environmental sustainability, and strengthening of the social dimension (social accompaniment) in programs aimed at slums.
- Improvement of resettlement processes (of families and/or communities) linked to better risk management and/or parameters of inclusive and sustainable urban development.

Possible lines of action:

1. Promote the recognition of the right to housing and the city in constitutional frameworks to strengthen its recognition in national frameworks for housing and urban planning.
2. Stimulate the creation of urban legal frameworks such as land use laws from a perspective of the right to the city to expand the offer of quality and inclusive land and housing.

3. Promote broad consensus around the development and implementation of national frameworks to try to reduce conflicts and confrontations between sectors and different government levels.
4. Align and link national policies, local plans, and planning processes, at the regulatory and budget levels.
5. Analyze the integration between the possibilities of collective properties, new models of property management (housing and land tenure) - for example, land and trust law - and local urban development plans.
6. Create strong institutions with the participation of different actors (communities, local governments, owners, developers, etc.), so that the financing tools based on land are effective.
7. Promote political and participatory processes to intervene in the city's production processes and in the real estate sector, to guarantee inclusive housing, be it through local councils or agreements between the actors involved in urban projects.
8. Diversify forms of financing, co-production, self-construction, and coordination with the private sector (as an ally), and not as a producer of capital gains. Incorporate climate change and environmental sustainability as a transversal axis since they mainly affect marginalized neighborhoods (for example: location in risk areas, greater vulnerability to disasters).
9. Continue large-scale improvement programs and investments and strengthen the social component of interventions.
10. Develop accessible and affordable modes of mobility to achieve integration with the city.

3. LAV's CONCLUSIONS

The integration of housing in urban policies is a problem that affects the entire Latin American region and also affects the efficiency and applicability of urban public policies, and therefore the sustainable development of cities.

A holistic view of housing thematic implies addressing problems such as land tenure and its management, the associated financing mechanisms, the competition regime, basic services and the adequate location of housing.

In this way, access to adequate housing should allow the exercise of the right to the city for its inhabitants.

It is necessary to be able to scale and replicate the good practices implemented in different countries so that they have a positive effect in the regional framework. In this sense, it is recommended that the actions taken to promote access to adequate housing, be part of an integrated and comprehensive framework of planning and urban management based on evidence that allows monitoring to evaluate the performance of policies.

Likewise, reference is made to the principles of cooperation and solidarity set forth in the NUA, regarding the co-responsibility of sub-national governments and the private sector to generate specific solutions, adapted to the specific characteristics of the territory, that provide a solution to the disintegration between housing policies and urban policies.

Participants emphasize institutional governance and citizen participation as cross-cutting tools for housing integration in the PNDIC. Institutional agreements and social consensus becomes a central thematic in this session, understanding that they form part of the basis for building integrated and sustainable public policies.

Four main approaches were identified to address the problem of housing integration in the PNDIC:

3.1 Approach through planning instruments:

The 2030 Agenda and the New Urban Agenda are identified as global benchmarks on which to support the construction of regulatory instruments and public policies. Martha Sánchez alluded to the 3 pillars of the NUA as a reference in the National Habitat and Housing Policy developed in Paraguay; Pablo Vitale recounted his experience in the work carried out in slums in Buenos Aires through the perspective of implementing the NUA; and Jeremías Diez-Canedo expressed the necessity to situate the SDGs through the proper location of housing and the visibility of the economic profitability of sustainable policies. Moira Vargas talked about the need to have a focus on vulnerable groups, to which Katrin Quillaguamán also referred, in the understanding of the priority of “leaving no one behind” in the formulation and implementation of public policies.

Gabriel Blanco raised the need for an approach based on Human Rights through the formulation of the normative elements, referring as good practice to the regulations that allow the social function of property, as an example of the national legal framework of Brazil, "Estatuto da Cidade", and an experience that has been implemented for 15 years.

Jhasilma Chacón identified the opportunity in Bolivia for a further regulatory development to curb the irregularity of the settlements and to integrate housing policy in the national context. He recognized that governance is a fundamental tool to achieve this regulatory development.

A consensus was reached among the participants on the relevance of influencing the thematic of governance from an institutional point of view. Thus, Paulina Saball explained that the PNDIC must be clear, diverse and transparent, in addition to proposing the strategy for its implementation through the permanent participation of all the actors. Likewise, he explained that the normative instruments must be consistent with social consensus and establish standards, indicators and incentives that favor the achievement of common objectives. Paulina mentioned the Chilean National Council for Urban Development as an experience and model of governance.

It is pertinent to have informed decision-making, based on evidence, and therefore the generation of territorialized data in order to generate a housing policy and a comprehensive urban planning. In this sense, Sirly Castro talked about the need to carry out differentiated interventions that adapt to real demand and to specific conditions of the territory, considering key strategies related to: productivity, governance and territorial planning, inter-jurisdictional coordination, financing and connectivity – physical and digital - of the territory, and quality of life (linked to housing, water and sanitation). Sirly mentioned the recent Colombian Cities System Policy as an example.

Given the experience of the results of Infonavit in recent decades, Jeremías Diez Canedo indicated that the adequate location of housing and social housing are a fundamental factor that must be taken into account in the PNDIC, considering the results obtained in other countries of the region, as in the Mexican case of mass production of housing in the periphery.

Some concrete urban processes are identified as opportunities for the integration of housing in the PNDIC. Anelisse Meléndez explained that the expansion in low density that the cities of Bolivia have suffered generates an inadequate location of part of the residential account. Inés Magalhaes and Paulina Saball reiterated that inadequate localization generates problems of social exclusion, poor habitability and increased cost of basic services in cities. Jeremías Diez-Canedo pointed out the associated negative environmental externalities. This low-density urban expansion process sometimes generates urban voids that Pablo Vitale, Paulina Saball and Inés Magalhaes identify as opportunities to re-densify cities and generate adequate social housing programs.

This low-density urban expansion process sometimes generates urban voids, which Pablo Vitale, Paulina Saball and Inés Magalhaes identify as opportunities to re-densify cities and generate adequate social housing programs.

Paulina Saball and Inés Magalhaes stated that urban planning tools at the municipal and neighborhood levels are an opportunity to reduce the quantitative and qualitative deficit in an integrated way, adding the reduction of the urban deficit. In this case Paulina focused attention

on the fact that Bolivia's deficit shows a greater degree in the qualitative dimension, which could mean guiding interventions more focused on the improvement of existing neighborhoods and of the community participation, a path that Chile has taken notoriously in the last decade (the program Quiero Mi Barrio (Love/Want my Neighborhood) from Chile was mentioned as an example). In addition, the case of Colombia highlights the importance of seeing housing beyond social and financial capital, but as an asset to generate income for communities, which through a connection with programs that promote economic activities make ventures sustainable.

The cases of Colombia and Brazil also highlight the importance of proposing changes in regulatory frameworks for the investment of public resources for the improvement of housing, including the connection to basic service networks, which have shown a significant change in the improvement of the quality of life of people in vulnerable conditions, who in many cases inhabit unregulated territories.

In the specific case of Brazil it is also highlighted that through the design of Master Plans it has been possible to make available instruments of great impact, such as those related to the regulation of land use, the capture of value increase, and especially the denomination of Special Zones of Social Interest (ZEIS) provided for in the Statute of the City, which allow the flexibility of urban regulations, offer mechanisms for land regularization (slums) and the production of new ventures (it is possible to reserve suitable parts of the city for housing).

Regarding this, Esteban León pointed out that the strengthening of planning instruments can lead to the reduction of negative environmental externalities, increasing the resilience of homes and therefore of cities, as long as risk maps and comprehensive resilience plans are included, as well as increase the effectiveness and applicability of the content of the plans. Claudia Bustos explained the importance of master plans that coordinate the different sectorial areas, including the need for more robust social management plans, supported by financial studies that can accompany their effective implementation.

In this context, the case of Brazil (as a federal country) highlights the conditional financing instrument that allows or helps municipalities (which are finally the administrators of the territory) to compel in the development of master plans, territorial planning, risks and others, in exchange for receiving financing.

3.2 Approach through the application of housing policy

The possibility of a reform of the institutional framework or its operation is addressed in order to favor the integration of housing in urban policy, the possibility of combining planning, housing and risk management in a single national framework. Regarding this, Inés Magalhaes presented the example of the Brazilian cities ministry, where the federal (national) level was closely connected with local policies on risk, planning and housing issues. She pointed out that despite the importance of having a clear look at liabilities it is also very important to have a clear look at demand, so that politics work with the growth process of cities, avoiding the formation of new liabilities-deficits.

Likewise, Paulina Saball highlighted the advantage of Bolivia in having within its constitutional framework the recognition of the Right to Housing. In this way, she indicates the focus that Chile has put on closely linking the housing strategy to the development of cities, paying particular attention to the marked phenomenon of socio-economic spatial segregation.

Some management tools are identified that could contribute to the integration of housing policy and urban policy in Bolivia. Some international practices are mentioned to take into account, such as the localization subsidy of Chile, the property portfolios, or the adequate land resource (example of the national land strategy in Uruguay, mentioned by Raúl Valles.).

Other Uruguayan examples are also presented in terms of improvements to the housing cooperatives system, also pointed out by Helmut Vega, and technical assistance programs for self-construction as measures to increase the material and urban adaptation of housing.

Paulina Saball brought up the incentives for savings, taking into account the large percentage of informal workers in Bolivia.

Jeremías Diez-Canedo suggested the pertinence of new housing solutions of a social nature such as rental housing, also bearing in mind the antichresis modality in Bolivia that could be an opportunity to generate social housing in a sustainable way if it is executed under the condition of reorientation of the subsidy.

The recovery of value increases and the assistance for access to land were mechanisms proposed by several of the participants to achieve an integrated implementation of the housing policy.

Inés Magalhaes identified the challenge that exists in Bolivia to serve informal workers through public housing policy.

In addition, María Luisa Zanelli insisted on the importance of returning the credibility of citizenship in the judicial system given that it has a very important role in terms of the implementation of the policy, attending to its functions related to land management, market systems and recognition of citizens' rights. In this regard, Anaclaudia Rossbach brought up the case of Brazil, which after 15 years of the Statute of Cities and 30 years of the Constitution where the social function of land is recognized, the country has gone through a process with important efforts to introduce a cultural change that reflects this recognition in the achieved interventions.

The absence of available information detected in Bolivia demonstrates the relevance of specific data collection tools to enable the housing policy implementation. In this sense, Jeremías Diez-Canedo identified the tool Prosperous Cities Index (CPI) used in 305 municipalities of Mexico as an instrument for generating evidence and later managing the information on cities.

Governance within management of public policies is mentioned through different points of view. Inés Magalhaes explained that from the complexity of building integrated processes in federal countries, the national government must have a general diagnosis and maintain a space for discussion with local government that become major actors in the implementation of public housing policies. She mentioned the Brazilian City Council as an instrument of governance at national level. Pablo Vitale presented the initiative "agreement with urbanization of villas" of Buenos Aires through citizen participation.

Mercedes di Virgilio shared the importance of agreements between the different levels of government, and Paulina Saball recommended generating the pertinent institutional

agreements prior to the formulation of public policies from the regulatory framework that have a continuous presence throughout the process.

3.3 Approach through alliances with participating actors

Paulina Saball explained that the Bolivian regime of competencies generates the opportunity for the national government to ally with the municipalities to achieve a joint strategy that favors access to adequate housing and avoids socio-spatial segregation.

Inés Magalhaes, Paulina Saball and Claudia Bustos explained that the interventions in degraded neighborhoods represent a comprehensive approach that can be undertaken from alliances with municipalities, for which it is necessary to study their technical and financial capacity. This also supposes the opportunity to work more closely the social scope of neighborhoods and allows approaching the rural housing deficit from a comprehensive development perspective. Héctor Becerril highlighted the necessity to influence the social part of the comprehensive neighborhood improvement strategies.

Jashilma Chacón was clear about the need of the Bolivian state to involve the private sector, specifically in relation to the innovation of construction processes. Claudia Bustos introduced the necessity for a collectively habitat production.

Inés Magalhaes noted that from the operational level of these alliances it is necessary to establish clear goals with each of the actors involved to divide the tasks and the existing economic resources.

Some areas of opportunity for private sector collaboration in the management of social housing policy are identified that allow agreements to produce well located social housing, as for example from the Mexican case in the verification and valuation of built social housing, as well as through land management tools as in the case of Brazil.

In this regard, Tulio Vázquez proposed several means to involve private actors in the housing production cycle. He identified the necessity to generate connected and available information in order to adjust housing supply to demand, specifically in relation to territorialized sectorial information, and also the relevance of generating links with fiscal policy to create profitability in social housing operations.

Héctor Becerril and Anelisse Meléndez pointed out that the participation of civil society is a key element in order to generate a sustainable and comprehensive PNDIC regarding the incorporation of the housing sector, especially considering vulnerable sectors that being in informal conditions are forced to opt for self-construction to improve housing to the detriment of other basic needs. Regarding this, several of the participants emphasized the need to make the processes of urban policy construction transparent.

Regarding the production of rural housing, the case of Brazil highlights the need to form alliances with the productive sector as has been done there with productive cooperatives where financing is thought in accordance with the existing mechanisms in those contexts, and where they have had a great impact through one of the lines of the *Minha Casa Minha Vida* (My House My Life) Program, with the construction of more than 200,000 houses in rural areas.

3.4 Approach through the strengthening of capabilities

María Luisa Zanelli identified that the strengthening of capacities is an essential element that the PNDIC must assume to favor the integration of the subject -and the dynamics- of housing with expansion and territorial ordering. This arises from the point of view of the different levels of government although the municipal level is presented as an area of special opportunity.

For the case of Brazil, the strengthening of capacities to municipalities and social movements as a strategy that the national government has to induce policies and programs for housing planning was outlined. Inés Magalhaes presented some successful experiences on strengthening capacities of municipal officials, based on a remote educational system. The relevance of technical study missions to other specific countries was also mentioned, from where different actors can intervene, especially civil society and the private sector. Likewise, technical assistance mechanisms were highlighted as strong contributors to the self-construction of houses in slums, an experience that could be transferred to the production of housing on urban land with the potential and purpose of making them being available for the authorities.

It is worth noting that the municipal technical units in Bolivia are in certain occasions technically weak to face the competences in terms of housing and urban planning. Tulio Vázquez and Helmut Vega stated that the strengthening of technical capabilities in the municipalities is a key factor in order to adequately implement housing policies.

Patricia Urquieta identifies the survey and accessibility of urban and housing data as key processes to empower institutional actors and civil society in the PNDIC construction process. Inés Magalhaes explained the specific need to collect information on risks and deficit neighborhoods and make it available. In this sense, Inés highlights the usefulness of the presence of stimulus mechanisms for the production of information at the national level, with local governments as the main protagonists, especially in terms of data regarding slums and their needs.

In addition, Sirly Castro highlights the institutional space present in the case of Bolivia that through its experience has proven in Colombia to be a clear opportunity to rescue data from observatories, platforms and databases belonging to various sectors and with it being able to have more information for the development of an existing evidence-based policy.

Patricia Urquieta and Paulina Saball mentioned the need for good practices' identified to be replicable and escalated at national level and in the region respectively. In this sense, through *Procasha* the fragmented progress occurring in Bolivia at the local level that could be systematized as an input to national policies was pointed out.

3.5 Good practices identified

- Paraguay's National Housing Policy and Habitat
- Paraguay's National Trust for Housing (FONAVIS)
- National Council on Urban Development, Chile

- Cities Council, Brazil
- National Consensus for an Adequate Habitat, Argentina
- City Prosperity Index, Mexico
- Remote teaching for municipal officers and social actors, Brazil
- Social Interest Special Zones (ZEIS), Brazil
- Cities Statute – legal framework, Brazil
- *Minha Casa Minha Vida* (My House My Life) Program, Brazil
- PAC- Comprehensive development program of Slums, Brazil
- *Quiero mi Barrio* (Love/Want my Neighborhood) Program, Chile (strong social component with community strengthening)
- Cities System Policy, Colombia
- National Strategy for Land, Uruguay
- Non-useful building mapping, Buenos Aires – Argentina.